

## WORKSHOP ON ASTROPHYSICAL OPACITIES

*COVER ILLUSTRATION:*

*The Solar Interior*

Natalya Critchley, Caracas, 2017.

ASTRONOMICAL SOCIETY OF THE PACIFIC  
CONFERENCE SERIES

A SERIES OF BOOKS ON RECENT DEVELOPMENTS IN ASTRONOMY AND ASTROPHYSICS

---

**Volume 515**

---

EDITORIAL STAFF

*Managing Editor:* Joseph Jensen  
*Associate Managing Editor:* Jonathan Barnes  
*Publication Manager:* Cindy Moody  
*Editorial Assistant:* Blaine Haws  
*Publication Consultant:* Pepita Ridgeway  
*e-Book Specialist:* Rachel Severson-Haws

MS 179, Utah Valley University, 800 W. University Parkway, Orem, Utah 84058-5999  
Phone: 801-863-8804      E-mail: [aspbooks.org](mailto:aspbooks.org)  
E-book site: <http://www.aspbooks.org>

PUBLICATION COMMITTEE

**Jeff Mangum**, co-Chair  
National Radio Astronomy Observatory

**Joseph Jensen**, co-Chair  
Utah Valley University

**Marsha J. Bishop**  
National Radio Astronomy Observatory

**William Cochran**  
University of Texas at Austin

**Bruce Elmegreen**  
IBM Watson Research Center

**Pamela Gay**  
Southern Illinois University

**Robert Hanish**  
National Institute of Standards and Technology

**Lynne Hillenbrand**  
California Institute of Technology

**Doug Leonard**  
San Diego State University

**Charles Telesco**  
University of Florida

ASPCS volumes may be found online with color images at <http://www.aspbooks.org>.  
ASP Monographs may be found online at <http://www.aspmonographs.org>.

For a complete list of ASPCS Volumes, ASP Monographs, and  
other ASP publications see <http://www.astrosociety.org/pubs.html>.

All book order and subscription inquiries should be directed to the ASP at  
800-335-2626 (toll-free within the USA) or 415-337-2126,  
or email [service@astrosociety.org](mailto:service@astrosociety.org)

ASTRONOMICAL SOCIETY OF THE PACIFIC  
CONFERENCE SERIES

---

Volume 515

---

**WORKSHOP ON ASTROPHYSICAL OPACITIES**

Proceedings of a workshop held at  
Fetzer Center, Western Michigan University, Kalamazoo, MI 49008, USA  
1–4 August 2017

Edited by

**Claudio Mendoza**

*Dept. of Physics, Western Michigan University, Kalamazoo, MI 49008, USA*

**Sylvaine Turck-Chièze**

*DAP/IRFU/CEA, UMR AIM, University Paris-Saclay, CE Saclay, 91191,  
Gif-sur-Yvette, France*

**James Colgan**

*Los Alamos National Laboratory, Los Alamos, NM 87545, USA*



SAN FRANCISCO

ASTRONOMICAL SOCIETY OF THE PACIFIC

390 Ashton Avenue  
San Francisco, California, 94112-1722, USA

Phone: 415-337-1100  
Fax: 415-337-5205

E-mail: [service@astrosoociety.org](mailto:service@astrosoociety.org)  
Web site: [www.astrosoociety.org](http://www.astrosoociety.org)  
E-books: [www.aspbooks.org](http://www.aspbooks.org)

First Edition  
© 2018 by Astronomical Society of the Pacific  
ASP Conference Series  
All rights reserved.

No part of the material protected by this copyright notice may be reproduced or utilized in any form or by any means—graphic, electronic, or mechanical, including photocopying, taping, recording, or by any information storage and retrieval system—with written permission from the Astronomical Society of the Pacific.

ISBN: 978-1-58381-914-2  
e-book ISBN: 978-1-58381-915-9

Library of Congress (LOC) Cataloging in Publication (CIP) Data:  
Main entry under title  
Library of Congress Control Number (LCCN): 2018942467

Printed in the United States of America by Sheridan Books, Ann Arbor, Michigan.  
This book is printed on acid-free paper.

## **IN MEMORIAM**

John N. Bahcall (1934–2005)

Arthur N. Cox (1927–2013)

David G. Hummer (1934–2015)

Dimitri M. Mihalas (1939–2013)

Forrest J. Rogers (1938–2013)

Michael J. Seaton (1923–2007)

## Contents

Preface . . . . .	xi
<i>Claudio Mendoza, Sylvaine Turck-Chièze, and James Colgan</i>	
Participants . . . . .	xiii
Conference Photograph . . . . .	xvii

### Part I. Stellar Opacities and the Solar Abundance Problem

Stellar Atomic Opacities . . . . .	3
<i>Sylvaine Turck-Chièze</i>	
Helioseismic Tests of Stellar Equations of State and Opacities . . . . .	13
<i>Sarbani Basu</i>	
Equations of State for Opacity Calculations . . . . .	23
<i>D. P. Kilcrease, J. Colgan, P. Hakel, C. J. Fontes, and M. E. Sherrill</i>	
The Dark Side of the Sun . . . . .	29
<i>Regner Trampedach</i>	

### Part II. Computation and Measurement of Atomic Opacities

Detailed Opacity Calculations for Stellar Models . . . . .	35
<i>Jean-Christophe Pain, Franck Gilleron, and Maxime Comet</i>	
Including All the Lines: Data Releases for Spectra and Opacities through 2017 . . . . .	47
<i>Robert L. Kurucz</i>	
New Los Alamos Opacities . . . . .	55
<i>J. Colgan, D. P. Kilcrease, N. H. Magee, M. E. Sherrill, C. J. Fontes, and P. Hakel</i>	
STAR – a New STA Code for the Calculation of Solar Opacities . . . . .	63
<i>Menahem Krief and Doron Gazit</i>	
A Quantitative Comparison of Opacities Calculated Using the Distorted-Wave and R-Matrix Methods . . . . .	69
<i>F. Delahaye, N. R. Badnell, C. P. Ballance, P. Palmeri, S. Preval, P. Quinet, C. Ramsbottom, R. T. Smyth, M. Turkington, and C. J. Zeippen</i>	

Recalculation of Astrophysical Opacities: Overview, Methodology, and Atomic Calculations . . . . .	79
<i>Anil K. Pradhan and Sultana N. Nahar</i>	
Converged <i>R</i> -Matrix Calculations of the Photoionization of Fe xvii in Astrophysical Plasmas: from Convergence to Completeness . . . . .	89
<i>Lianshui Zhao, Werner Eissner, Sultana N. Nahar, and Anil K. Pradhan</i>	
The IRON Project: Photoionization of Fe Ions . . . . .	93
<i>Sultana N. Nahar</i>	
Progress on a Double Ablation Front Scheme for Iron Spectral Opacity Measurements in Solar Conditions . . . . .	104
<i>A. Colaïtis, J.-E. Ducret, S. Turck-Chièze, M. Le Pennec, L. Jacquet, and C. Blancard</i>	
Update on the Iron Opacity Experiments on the NIF . . . . .	115
<i>T. S. Perry, R. F. Heeter, Y. P. Opachich, J. A. King, E. S. Dodd, B. G. DeVolder, M. E. Sherrill, B. G. Wilson, C. A. Iglesias, J. L. Kline, K. A. Flippo, T. Cardenas, J. A. Emig, T. N. Archuleta, E. J. Huffman, M. F. Ahmed, M. B. Schneider, D. A. Liedahl, T. J. Urbatsch, J. E. Bailey, and G. A. Rochau</i>	

### **Part III. Computation and Measurement of Molecular Opacities**

An Overview of Molecular Opacities . . . . .	125
<i>Peter Bernath</i>	
Molecular Line Lists and Absorption Cross Sections Based on Laboratory Measurements . . . . .	132
<i>Peter Bernath</i>	
The ExoMol Project: Molecular Opacity Calculations at University College London . . . . .	137
<i>Jonathan Tennyson</i>	
The Los Alamos National Laboratory Molecular Opacity Project and the Photodissociation Isotopic Effects of H <sub>2</sub> <sup>+</sup> and D <sub>2</sub> <sup>+</sup> . . . . .	145
<i>Mark C. Zammit, Jeremy S. Savage, James Colgan, Dmitry V. Fursa, Igor Bray, Jeffery Leiding, Cristiano Nisoli, Christopher J. Fontes, David P. Kilcrease, Peter Hakel, and Eddy Timmermans</i>	
Accurate and Consistent Prediction of Molecular IR Line Lists Based on Ab Initio Theory and High-Resolution Experimental Data . . . . .	155
<i>Xinchuan Huang, David W. Schwenke, and Timothy J. Lee</i>	

### **Part IV. Stellar Atomic Diffusion**

On the Importance of Atomic Data and Opacities in Evaluating the Effects of Atomic Diffusion in Stars . . . . .	169
<i>Georges Alecian</i>	

Opacity Enhancement Due to Diffusion-Induced Element Accumulation inside B-Type Stars . . . . .	176
<i>Alain Hui-Bon-Hoa, Sylvie Vauclair, and Morgan Deal</i>	
Hydrodynamical Instabilities Induced by Atomic Diffusion in F and A Stars . . . . .	181
<i>Morgan Deal, Olivier Richard, and Sylvie Vauclair</i>	

## Part V. Stellar Models

The Role of Opacities in Stellar Pulsation . . . . .	189
<i>S. M. Kanbur, M. Marconi, A. Bhardwaj, R. Kundu, and H. P. Singh</i>	
Testing Opacities Using the SED Variability of Chemically Peculiar Stars . . . . .	195
<i>J. Krtička, L. Huang, T. Lüftinger, Z. Mikulášek, E. Niemczura, M. Prvák, J. Silvester, G. Wade, and J. Zverko</i>	
METUJE Global Hot Star Wind Models . . . . .	201
<i>Jiří Krtička and Jiří Kubát</i>	
Rayleigh Scattering as an Opacity Source in Stellar Atmospheres . . . . .	207
<i>Jakub Fišák, Jiří Kubát, and Jiří Krtička</i>	
The Bedisk and Beray Circumstellar Disk Codes . . . . .	213
<i>T. A. Aaron Sigut</i>	

## Part VI. Brown Dwarfs, Exoplanets, and Protoplanetary Disks

Opacities from Molecules and Aerosols in Exoplanet and Brown Dwarf Atmospheres . . . . .	221
<i>Caroline V. Morley</i>	
The Role of Opacities in Calculating the Structure and Evolution of Protoplanetary Disks . . . . .	231
<i>Nuria Calvet</i>	
ATMOS: Towards Resolving Ambiguities in the Spectroscopic Detection of Life . . . . .	241
<i>Clara Sousa-Silva, Janusz J. Petkowski, and Sara Seager</i>	
Monte Carlo Simulations of Biophysical Factors for Viability of Life in Exoplanetary Atmospheres . . . . .	249
<i>Maximillian S. Westphal and Anil K. Pradhan</i>	

## Part VII. Astrophysical Processes and Atomic Data

The Belgian Repository of Fundamental Atomic Data and Stellar Spectra: Atomic Line Data Validation . . . . .	255
<i>A. Lobel, P. Royer, C. Martayan, M. Laverick, T. Merle, P. A. M. van Hoof, M. Van der Swaelmen, M. David, H. Hensberge, and E. Thienpont</i>	

The Belgian Repository of Fundamental Atomic Data and Stellar Spectra: an Insight into Systematic Line Selection . . . . .	263
<i>M. Laverick, A. Lobel, P. Royer, C. Martayan, T. Merle, P. A. M. van Hoof, M. Van der Swaelmen, M. David, H. Hensberge, and E. Thienpont</i>	
Dielectronic Recombination Calculations for Si-like Ions and the S <sup>2+</sup> Orion Nebula Abundance Conundrum . . . . .	269
<i>Jagjit Kaur and Thomas W. Gorczyca</i>	
X-Ray Absorption by Interstellar Atomic Gases near the K Edges of C, O, Ne, Mg, and Si and the L Edge of Fe . . . . .	275
<i>Muhammet Fatih Hasoglu and Thomas W. Gorczyca</i>	
The Problem of the High Iron Abundance in Accretion Disks around Black Holes . . . . .	282
<i>J. A. García, T. R. Kallman, M. Bautista, C. Mendoza, J. Deprince, P. Palmeri, and P. Quinet</i>	
Plasma-Environment Effects on the Atomic Structure and K Lines of He- and Li-like Oxygen Ions . . . . .	289
<i>J. Deprince, P. Palmeri, P. Quinet, S. Fritzsche, M. Bautista, C. Mendoza, T. R. Kallman, and J. A. García</i>	
On the Light-Curve Anomalies of Radio Pulsars . . . . .	295
<i>H. L. Hakobyan, A. A. Philippov, V. S. Beskin, A. K. Galishnikova, E. M. Novoselov, and M. M. Rashkovetskyi</i>	

### Part VIII. Epilogue

Current State of Astrophysical Opacities: A White Paper . . . . .	301
<i>A. E. Lynas-Gray, S. Basu, M. A. Bautista, J. Colgan, C. Mendoza, J. Tennyson, R. Trampedach, and S. Turck-Chièze</i>	
A Modelers' Opacity Wish List . . . . .	319
<i>Regner Trampedach</i>	
<i>Author Index</i> . . . . .	323

## Preface

The present volume contains the proceedings of a workshop that took place during the first week of August 2017 in Western Michigan University, Kalamazoo, Michigan, USA, to discuss in extenso the topic of astrophysical opacities and to review new updates in the field.

A previous Workshop on Astrophysical Opacities (WAO) was held at the IBM Venezuela Scientific Center, Caracas, in July 1991 to evaluate the physics and preliminary results of a major revision of the metal opacities by two independent teams: OPAL and the Opacity Project (OP). This revision was required at the time in the face of long-standing discrepancies in stellar pulsation and evolution studies referred to collectively as the *Cepheid mass problem*. It was also the time of the first encounters of the opacity groups (OPAL, OP, and CEA) with helioseismologists, who were making preparations for the launch of the Solar and Heliospheric Observatory (SOHO), the longest-lived and most productive heliophysics probe.

In the present occasion the meeting was motivated by two turning points in astrophysical modeling: the solar abundance problem and the exoplanet explosion.

The solar abundance problem arose in 2005 through a downward correction of the solar metal abundances resulting from three-dimensional hydrodynamic simulations of the solar photosphere, which took into account non-LTE and granulation effects. This new endorsement downgraded the precise reproduction of the helioseismic benchmarks by the Standard Solar Model, thus casting doubts on the reliability of the opacity tables in spite of satisfactory agreement between OPAL and OP. The accuracy of the opacity tables has also been questioned in analyses of recent asteroseismic observations of hybrid B-type pulsators. Both of these cases appear to suggest additional radiative absorption processes not accounted for.

This critical situation has led to extensive comparisons of the bases of opacity computations (accurate and complete atomic datasets, equation of state, line broadening, high-density effects, to name a few), to the emergence of new numerical approaches that handle more efficiently the very large numbers of spectral lines (e.g., *super-transition arrays*); and innovative laboratory experiments (namely, on the Z facility at Sandia National Laboratories). However, the latter has engendered a new and puzzling disagreement between theory and experiment that is still unresolved, and the missing stellar opacity remains elusive. It is worth noting that the importance of opacities in the study of stellar interiors and the need for experimental validation of the computed tables have encouraged the upgrade of large-scale laser facilities, such as the National Ignition Facility (NIF) and Laser MegaJoule (LMJ), to handle plasmas at very high temperatures.

The exoplanet explosion began in the mid 1990s with the discovery of the first planets orbiting other main-sequence stars and with the thousands more detected since then by the space probes *Kepler* and *Corot*. The possibilities of modeling brown-dwarf and exoplanetary atmospheres and protoplanetary disks have hugely escalated the demand for comprehensive molecular opacities, which have been addressed by ambitious projects such as HITRAN and ExoMol. Such studies also require opacities from sources such as aerosols and dust, whose accuracy and scope are far from fulfilling present needs. Moreover, with the discovery of Earth-like exoplanets, determining well-defined atmospheric biosignatures has caught the attention of both producers and users of molecular spectroscopy data due to their inherent complexity and breadth.

The WAO attracted a sizable group of experts who found in the Fetzer Center of Western Michigan University comfortable and cozy surroundings for open discussion on most of the aforementioned topics. Stellar atomic diffusion and the use of stellar observations to test the accuracy of both opacities and atomic databases were also considered, as well as basic atomic processes such as dielectronic recombination and K absorption. Hardly a fortnight after the WAO, the worldwide astronomical community witnessed in awe the binary neutron-star merger GW170817 that gave birth to the new era of multi-messenger astronomy. This type event has been found to produce copious heavy elements (e.g., lanthanides) through rapid neutron capture, whose thick opacities need extensive refinement before the ensuing transient light curve can be properly characterized.

Finally, we would like to dedicate this volume in memoriam to six exceptional scientists—John N. Bahcall, Arthur N. Cox, David G. Hummer, Dimitri M. Mihalas, Forrest J. Rogers, and Michael J. Seaton—who dedicated a great part of their scientific work to the advancement and applications of this important field. Their contributions were seminal, their leadership and legacy shaped indelibly its cutting edge, and their mentoring is well imprinted in the intellectual lucidity of many of us.

The Editors

Claudio Mendoza, Sylvaine Turck-Chièze, and James Colgan

### **Scientific Organizing Committee**

James E. Bailey (Sandia National Laboratory, USA)  
Manuel Bautista (Western Michigan University, USA)  
James Colgan (Los Alamos National Laboratory, USA)  
Carlos Iglesias (Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory, USA)  
Claudio Mendoza (Western Michigan University, USA)  
Jonathan Tennyson (University College London, UK)  
Sylvaine Turck-Chièze (Commissariat à l’Energie Atomique, France)  
Claude Zeippen (Observatoire de Paris, France)

### **Local Organizing Committee**

Manuel Bautista (Western Michigan University, USA)  
Thomas Gorczyca (Western Michigan University, USA)  
Kirk Korista (Chair, Western Michigan University, USA)  
Claudio Mendoza (Western Michigan University, USA)

### **Workshop Staff**

Teagan H. Young (Western Michigan University, USA)  
Otoh Ulrich (Western Michigan University and University of Kentucky, USA)

### **Sponsors**

College of Arts and Sciences, Western Michigan University, USA  
Department of Physics, Western Michigan University, USA

## Participants

EHAB AHMED, Dept. of Physics, Western Michigan University, 1903 W Michigan Ave, Kalamazoo, MI 49008-5252, USA ⟨ ehab.ahmed@wmich.edu ⟩

GEORGES ALECIAN, LUTH, Observatoire de Paris, PSL Research University, CNRS, Université Paris Diderot, 5 Place Jules Janssen, F-92195 Meudon Cedex, France ⟨ georges.alecian@obspm.fr ⟩

JAMES E. BAILEY, Sandia National Laboratories, 1515 Eubank SE, Albuquerque, NM 87185-1196, USA ⟨ jebaile@sandia.gov ⟩

SARBANI BASU, Astronomy Dept., Yale University, PO Box 208101, New Haven, CT 06511, USA ⟨ sarbani.basu@yale.edu ⟩

MANUEL BAUTISTA, Dept. of Physics, Western Michigan University, 1903 W Michigan Ave, Kalamazoo, MI 49008-5252, USA ⟨ manuel.bautista@wmich.edu ⟩

PETER BERNATH, Dept. of Chemistry and Biochemistry, Old Dominion University, 5115 Hampton Blvd, Norfolk, VA 23529-0126, USA ⟨ pbernath@odu.edu ⟩

MONCEF BOULEDROUA, Faculté de Médecine & L.P.R., Université Badji Mokhtar, BP 205, Annaba, 23000, Algeria ⟨ boulmoncef@netscape.net ⟩

NURIA CALVET, Dept. of Astronomy, University of Michigan, 1085 S University Ave, Ann Arbor, MI 48109, USA ⟨ ncalvet@umich.edu ⟩

ARNAUD COLAÏTIS, Centre Lasers Intenses et Applications, University of Bordeaux-CNRS-CEA, 33405 Talence, France ⟨ colaitis1@llnl.gov ⟩

JAMES COLGAN, Theoretical Division, Los Alamos National Laboratory, MS B221, Los Alamos, NM 87545, USA ⟨ jcolgan@lanl.gov ⟩

MORGAN DEAL, LESIA, Observatoire de Paris, 5 Place Jules Janssen, F-92195 Meudon Cedex, France ⟨ morgan.deal@obspm.fr ⟩

FRANCK DELAHAYE, LERMA, Observatoire de Paris, 5 Place Jules Janssen, F-92195 Meudon Cedex, France ⟨ franck.delahaye@obspm.fr ⟩

JÉRÔME DEPRINCE, Université de Mons (UMONS), 20 Place du Parc, B7000 Mons, Belgium ⟨ jerome.deprince@umons.ac.be ⟩

JAKUB FiŠÁK, Dept. of Theoretical Physics and Astrophysics, Masaryk University, CZ-611 37 Brno, Czech Republic ⟨ fisak@physics.muni.cz ⟩

ALISA GALISHNIKOVA, Moscow Institute of Physics and Technology, 21/6 Moskovskoe Highway, Dolgoprudny City, 141700 Moscow Region, Russian Federation ⟨ galishnikova.ak@phystech.edu ⟩

JAVIER GARCÍA, California Institute of Technology, 1200 E California Blvd, M/C 290-17, Pasadena, CA 91125, USA ⟨ javier@caltech.edu ⟩

DORON GAZIT, The Hebrew University of Jerusalem & Racah Institute of Physics, Popick Bldg. #126, Givat Ram, 9190401 Jerusalem, Israel ⟨ doron.gazit@mail.huji.ac.il ⟩

THOMAS GORCZYCA, Dept. of Physics, Western Michigan University, 1903 West Michigan Ave, Kalamazoo, MI 49008-5252, USA ⟨ thomas.gorczyca@wmich.edu ⟩

- IOULI GORDON, Atomic and Molecular Physics Division, Harvard-Smithsonian Center for Astrophysics, MS#50, 60 Garden St, Cambridge, MA 02138, USA  
 ⟨ igordon@cfa.harvard.edu ⟩
- STEPHANIE HANSEN, Sandia National Laboratories, 1515 Eubank SE, Albuquerque, NM 87185, USA ⟨ sbhanse@sandia.gov ⟩
- MUHAMMET FATIH HASOĞLU, Faculty of Engineering, Hasan Kalyoncu University, Havalimani Yolu 8.km, Sahinbey, 27100 Gaziantep, Turkey  
 ⟨ mfatih.hasoglu@hku.edu.tr ⟩
- XINCHUAN HUANG, SETI/NASA Ames Research Center, MS 245-6, Moffett Field, CA 94035, USA ⟨ xinchuan.huang-1@nasa.gov ⟩
- CARLOS IGLESIAS, Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory, PO Box 808, Livermore, CA 94550, USA ⟨ iglesias1@llnl.gov ⟩
- TIMOTHY R. KALLMAN, NASA Goddard Space Flight Center, Mail Code 662, Greenbelt, MD 20771, USA ⟨ timothy.r.kallman@nasa.gov ⟩
- SHASHI M. KANBUR, Dept. of Physics, State University of New York, 7060 State Route 104, Oswego, NY 13126-3599, USA ⟨ shashi.kanbur@oswego.edu ⟩
- JAGJIT KAUR, Dept. of Physics, Western Michigan University, 1903 W Michigan Ave, Kalamazoo, MI 49008-5252, USA ⟨ fnu.jagjitkaur@wmich.edu ⟩
- DAVID KILCREASE, Los Alamos National Laboratory, MS B214, Box 1663, Los Alamos, NM 87545, USA ⟨ dpk@lanl.gov ⟩
- KIRK KORISTA, Dept. of Physics, Western Michigan University, 1903 W Michigan Ave, Kalamazoo, MI 49008-5252, USA ⟨ kirk.korista@wmich.edu ⟩
- MENAHEM KRIEF, The Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Popick Bldg #126, Givat Ram, 9190401 Jerusalem, Israel ⟨ menahem.krief@mail.huji.ac.il ⟩
- JIRI KRTICKA, Dept. of Theoretical Physics and Astrophysics, Masaryk University, CZ-611 37 Brno, Czech Republic ⟨ krticka@physics.muni.cz ⟩
- ROBERT KURUCZ, Harvard-Smithsonian Center for Astrophysics, 60 Garden St, Cambridge, MA 02138, USA ⟨ rkurucz@cfa.harvard.edu ⟩
- MIKE LAVERICK, Institute of Astronomy, Katholieke Universiteit Leuven, Celestijnenlaan 200D Box 2401, 3001 Leuven, Belgium  
 ⟨ mike.laverick@kuleuven.be ⟩
- ALEX LOBEL, Royal Observatory of Belgium, Ringlaan 3, B-1180 Brussels, Belgium  
 ⟨ alex.lobel@oma.be ⟩
- ANTHONY E. LYNAS-GRAY, Dept. of Physics, University of Oxford, Keble Road, Oxford OX1 3RH, UK ⟨ aelg@astro.ox.ac.uk ⟩
- CLAUDIO MENDOZA, Dept. of Physics, Western Michigan University, 1903 W Michigan Ave, Kalamazoo, MI 49008-5252, USA ⟨ claudio.mendozaguardia@wmich.edu ⟩
- CAROLINE MORLEY, Harvard-Smithsonian Center for Astrophysics, 60 Garden St, Cambridge, MA 02138, USA ⟨ caroline.morley@cfa.harvard.edu ⟩
- TAISUKE NAGAYAMA, Sandia National Laboratories, 1515 Eubank SE, Albuquerque, NM 87185-1196, USA ⟨ tnnagay@sandia.gov ⟩

- SULTANA NAHAR, Dept. of Astronomy, The Ohio State University, 140 W 18th Ave, Columbus, OH 43210, USA ⟨ nahar.1@osu.edu ⟩
- EGOR NOVOSELOV, Moscow Institute of Physics and Technology, 21/6 Moskovskoe Highway, Dolgoprudny City, 141700 Moscow, Russian Federation ⟨ novoselov.em@phystech.edu ⟩
- JEAN-CHRISTOPHE PAIN, Commissariat a l'Energie Atomique, CEA/DAM/DIF, F-91297 Arpajon, France ⟨ jean-christophe.pain@cea.fr ⟩
- PATRICK PALMERI, Université de Mons (UMONS), 20 Place du Parc, B7000 Mons, Belgium ⟨ patrick.palmeri@umons.ac.be ⟩
- TED PERRY, Los Alamos National Laboratory, PO Box 1663, Los Alamos, NM 87545, USA ⟨ perry15@llnl.gov ⟩
- ANIL PRADHAN, Dept. of Astronomy, The Ohio State University, 100 W 18th Ave, Columbus, OH 43210, USA ⟨ pradhan.1@osu.edu ⟩
- AARON SIGUT, Dept. of Physics and Astronomy, The University of Western Ontario, 1151 Richmond St, London ON N6A 3K7, Canada ⟨ asigut@uwo.ca ⟩
- CLARA SOUSA-SILVA, Dept. of Earth, Atmospheric and Planetary Sciences, Massachusetts Institute of Technology, Building 54-1719, 77 Massachusetts Ave, Cambridge, MA 02139, USA ⟨ clara@space.mit.edu ⟩
- JONATHAN TENNYSON, Dept. of Physics and Astronomy, University College London, Gower St, London WC1E 6BT, UK ⟨ j.tennyson@ucl.ac.uk ⟩
- REGNER TRAMPEDACH, Space Science Institute, 4750 Walnut Street, #205, Boulder, CO 80301, USA ⟨ rtrampedach@spacescience.org ⟩
- SYLVAIN TURCK-CHIÈZE, DAP/IRFU/CEA, UMR AIM, University Paris-Saclay, 91191 Gif-sur-Yvette, France ⟨ cturck@cea.fr ⟩
- OTHO ULRICH, Dept. of Physics, Western Michigan University, and University of Kentucky, 359 Chem.-Phys. Building, 505 Rose St, Lexington, KY 40506-0055, USA ⟨ otho@uky.edu ⟩
- MAXIMILLIAN WESTPHAL, Dept. of Astronomy, The Ohio State University, 100 W 18th Ave, Columbus, OH 43210, USA ⟨ westphal.21@osu.edu ⟩
- MADHUSHANI WICKRAMARATHNA, Dept. of Physics, Western Michigan University, 1903 W Michigan Ave, Kalamazoo, MI 49008-5252, USA ⟨ mnc1255@wmich.edu ⟩
- BRIAN WILSON, Lawrence Livermore National Laboratory, Mail Stop L-473, PO Box 808, Livermore, CA 94551-0808, USA ⟨ wilson9@llnl.gov ⟩
- TEAGAN H. YOUNG, Dept. of Physics, Western Michigan University, 1903 W Michigan Ave, Kalamazoo, MI 49008-5252, USA ⟨ tnk4583@wmich.edu ⟩
- MARK ZAMMIT, Los Alamos National Laboratory, T-1 Group Office, PO Box 1663, MS B221, Los Alamos, NM 87545, USA ⟨ mzammit@lanl.gov ⟩
- LIANSHUI ZHAO, Dept. of Physics, The Ohio State University, 191 West Woodruff Ave., Columbus, OH 43210, USA ⟨ zhao.1157@osu.edu ⟩